

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

This PDF is auto-generated for reference only. As such, it may contain some conversion errors and/or missing information. For all formal use please refer to the official version on the website, as linked below.

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

<https://www.e-ir.info/2016/07/31/why-is-it-so-difficult-to-fight-human-trafficking/>

MARIYA GROZDANOVA, JUL 31 2016

Why is it so difficult to fight human trafficking?

In recent years, human trafficking for the purpose of sexual or labour exploitation became an issue on the top of the political agenda of a great number of countries in the international system of states. While students all around the world learn with a great enthusiasm about the role of the Civil War (1865) in ending slavery in America and the Slavery Convention of the League of Nations (1926) that banned this inhumane practice internationally, slavery in its cruelest form is very much alive today.[1] The whole idea of human beings treated as property that can be bought, sold or exploited for economic gains cannot be recognized as a shameful part of the evolutionary history of humankind and today there are more people being deprived from their liberty and basic human rights than ever before.[2] In fact, despite its clandestine nature and scarcity of systematic empirical research resulting in varying estimates, cross-border and internal trafficking in persons for the purposes of servitude in the sex or labor industries is considered to affect 20.9 to 35.8 million people worldwide[3] while generating incomes of \$31.6 billion illicit dollars annually.[4]

The stories of Seba, a 22-year-old woman from Mali taken by a French family when she was a child to perpetually and coarsely work as a domestic servant for no pay under the threat of violence [5] and the one of Tetiana who, under the poisonous influence of poverty, was lured by tempting offer to work as au pair in Italy taking 10 times her Ukrainian salary, but ended up as prostitute in Istanbul, Turkey while beaten, raped, and held in inhumane conditions with few chances to escape [6], are far from being exceptional. Unfortunately, this is a global problem touching almost every country from Africa and South Asia to Latin America and Eastern Europe and people of poor socio-economic background are being targeted and forced into servitude through violence or deception. Despite the fragmented nature of the anti-trafficking regime[7] and the emergence of a complex anti-trafficking security governance system, consisting of approaches designed to prosecute traffickers, protect victims, and prevent trafficking, or the so-called '3P' paradigm acting as a policy framework, the world proved unprepared to deal with one of the greatest humanitarian problems of the 21st century.[8]

Therefore, as there has been little agreement among scholars on the reasons why human trafficking became a crime so difficult to fight, this study would try to shed light on this issue by arguing that along with (1) problems with the legal definition of trafficking and scarcity of comprehensive data about the scope of the problem that are the basis for further action, there are also (2) inadequate measures to prosecute traffickers, protect victims, and prevent trafficking. To do so, the study will firstly put the topic in its empirical context and examine some of the activities taken to counter human trafficking while focusing on the 2003 Palermo Protocol and identifying some of its weaknesses. Consequently, it will critically evaluate the difficulties that the international community face in countering human trafficking following the 3P paradigm and will make its final remarks and suggestions for improvements and further research. It is worth noting that while many studies focus on a particular region and form of human trafficking, this study would concentrate on trafficking for sex or labour purposes by taking a more general approach, illustrated by the usage of empirically-based examples aimed at demonstrating the global dimensions of the problem. Nonetheless, it is worth noting that this study recognizes as limitations the analytical exclusion of prevention in countries of transit and destination and the fact that the three governance approaches examined in the second part of this study represent ideal-types complementing and overlapping with each other.

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

Human Trafficking and Counter-Efforts: Legal and Institutional Framework

Early international legislative developments such as the 1949 United Nations (UN) Convention on the Suppression of Trafficking in Women and Exploitation of Prostitution of Others and the 1959 (UN) Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade, and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery became the building blocks of the international anti-slavery movement.^[9] Nonetheless, the great population movements in the 80s and the 90s opened a demand side for illegal channels of migration, thus creating new international dynamics and making people aspiring a better life vulnerable to the sieges of the flourishing organized crime. The recognition that the problem of trafficking in persons has increased^[10] triggered considerable international attention and resulted in the 2003 UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children.^[11] The Palermo Protocol, as it became known, supplemented the 2000 (UN) Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (TOC) and outlined the first normative definition of the crime. Having in mind the overall number of the UN member states, it could be argued that the Protocol received a universal recognition as of December 2015 it has been ratified by 169 parties that by the means of cooperation are obligated to prevent, prosecute trafficking in persons and assist victims with full respect to their human rights.^[12]

Despite the protracted debates during the 'Vienna process'^[13], states agreed that under Article 3 (a) human trafficking shall mean the *activity* of '...recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by *means* [Italic added] of the threat or use of force or another forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the *purpose* [Italic added] of exploitation ...'.^[14] As further recognized by the document, the idea of consent is irrelevant when there are elements of exploitation and thus consensual migration cannot be used as a defense to the offence. Nonetheless, many countries such as the US consider that if a person agree to being trafficked, this can be used as a barrier for the prosecution of the trafficker.^[15] In this sense, international organizations (IOs) often find their hands tied as debates over the voluntary/involuntary acting prostitutes, for example, are still on national agendas. Therefore, the establishment of a clear definition of 'deception' and 'coercion' is fundamental in order for governments to adhere to the legal positions of the Palermo Protocol without space for maneuvering. Indeed, while in legal terms migrant smuggling and human trafficking represent separate offences^[16], it is a mistake to consider that there are not interrelated as in practice it is too often that the former descends into the latter. Additionally, despite that the Palermo Protocol does not make such a distinction, some countries consider international passage a requirement in their trafficking definitions, meaning that internal trafficking is not recognized as a criminal offence.^[17]

In this sense, despite that the Protocol encourages states to uphold and enforce the trafficking definition, its broad wording created international disagreements and made it sensitive to the interpretation of domestic legislatures, creating their own definitions. This impedes cooperation among origin, transit, and destination countries as for example extradition treaties require the crime to be common to both jurisdictions which is hardly achievable when different states' recognition of what constitutes a trafficking crime varies significantly.^[18] While it is identifiable that there is lack of common definition serving as a legal basis for any further action implying for lack of legally binding implementation mechanism and weak monitoring, there are also problems with the Protocol's criminal law orientation towards the suppression and criminalization of the supply side of trafficking rather than human rights orientation towards the protection of victims.^[19]

Another problem that stems largely from the lack of a common definition is the lack of comprehensive data on the scope of the problem. While this could be a result of the clandestine nature of this illicit activity that remains under-reported, under-detected and thus under-prosecuted, official criminal justice statistics on trafficking proved to be uncomprehensive due to differences in data gathering methodology.^[20] For instance, human trafficking has been called an undocumented crime with 'guesstimates' which was reinforced by the unsuccessful attempt of the EU to evaluate the extent of trafficking in 27 countries, each giving self-reported data based on their own methodology and understanding of the problem.^[21] In this sense, unless we have one single definition of human trafficking and harmonization of laws and practices, it is highly unlikely that accurate numbers will be provided and that attention and resources will be allocated adequately and to the right places in order to tackle the problem successfully.

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

Nonetheless, it is important that in the changed post-Cold War ideological and institutional dynamics actors were able to recognize the functional need for a complex security governance system, addressing the various causes and consequences of human trafficking.[22] As a result, a great variety of public and private actors became actively involved in the formulation and implementation of anti-trafficking binding policy decisions and intensified their cooperation considerably. Along with governments, implementing domestic anti-trafficking laws such as the 2000 US Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA)[23], IOs and international governmental organizations (IGOs) such as NATO[24], OSCE[25], and the Council of Europe[26] adopted conventions, policies, and enhanced collaboration. Moreover, *nongovernmental organizations (NGOs)* and *private businesses* proved an essential part of the puzzle since respectively serving as a watchdog and providing support to victims and contributing to a more stable economy. In this sense, contemporary anti-trafficking measures are eloquent for a paradigmatic shift from government to security governance having at its heart the approaches to prosecute traffickers, protect victims, and prevent trafficking.[27]

Difficulties in Countering Human Trafficking: The '3P' Paradigm

To begin with, prosecution of traffickers is a fundamental governance approach that is related to some activities such as the adoption of unambiguous anti-trafficking laws, the arrest of traffickers, the freezing of their assets, and the training of police officers, lawyers, and judges. While governments are the primary actors, IGOs such as the International Organization for Migration (IOM) are highly involved in training judicial and law enforcement officials, followed by NGOs having a watchdog function and employing 'naming and shaming' strategies. Nonetheless, it has been identified that 'the culture of police agencies and the perceptions of police officials about human trafficking do not support the identification of a broad range of human trafficking cases'.[28] For instance, trafficked women and men are usually seen as breaking prostitution or migration laws rather than as victims of trafficking, which makes them unwilling to bear witness against traffickers. [29] In this sense, authorities take non-discriminatory approach despite that, at least theoretically, the Palermo Protocol stresses the importance of law enforcement measures strictly focused against traffickers.[30] Moreover, victims are afraid to testify due to lenient sentences as evidenced by the national legislations of notable anti-trafficking pioneers such as the US and the UK and inappropriate behavior on the behalf of policemen who refer victims to shelter only if they testify.[31] These fears are further nurtured by the fact that traffickers are not being arrested or convicted due to red tape and corruption.[32] For example, in 2008 the former president of Cambodia avoided prosecution after receiving \$30,000 in order to release a brothel owner imprisoned for trafficking.

As police authorities usually lack the training required or even the manpower and technology to attack sophisticated organized crime networks, there are struggles with the identification and investigation of human trafficking offenses.[33] Due to budgetary restrictions a Bosnian senior police official, for example, stated that his four inspectors responsible for combating organized crime had to use one computer that was broken.[34] Along with this, police officials are uncertain about what constitutes the crime itself and they are often unable to distinguish between exploitive labor practices and poor working conditions, prostitution, and human trafficking.[35] The idea that human trafficking is primarily sex trafficking is impeding any real development in countering human trafficking for labor purposes which according to the International Labor Organization is the prevalent form of exploitation worldwide.[36] After all, when one is uncertain about the essence of the crime, its identification and prioritization become mission impossible. Indeed, the distinct nature of human trafficking is rarely recognized and police officers conduct first interviews inappropriately by putting pressure on victims or witnesses to give too much information. In this sense, traditional investigative practices designed for tackling other crimes and the reactive rather than proactive approach are often obscuring police from prosecuting traffickers.[37]

Nonetheless, this is not an easy task at least because of emergence of decentralized 'dark networks' difficult to follow and break in the realities of globalization^[38] which also impedes the creation of a universal profile of traffickers and victims. Moreover, even when police authorities are proactive and develop intelligence, organize undercover operations and police raids to save victims, traffickers may become aware that they are monitored and adapt to the new environment by switching from brothels to private buildings and from transnational to internal trafficking. [39]

Secondly, protection for potential or identified victims and satisfaction of their basic needs such as shelter, food, and

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

clothing to legal and psychological assistance is needed in order to preserve them harmless. Along with governments, the involvement of IGOs such as IOM that are leading in the efforts of returning and reintegrating trafficking victims, NGOs 'working on the ground', and transport and hospitality businesses required to tightened their control, is essential.[40] While in recent years, some bilateral agreements proved effective in returning victims across borders, it is not always reasonable to send them 'home', presuming they have one, especially in cases of armed conflict and political unrest.[41] If the person does not have a legal status, he or she is more likely to be exploited again and revenged for disobedience. In this sense, due to issues of sovereignty that are still on the agenda, victim protection and support is left to the will of the state and is not entitled as a legally binding posture in the Palermo Protocol.

Moreover, along with the fear of deportation to their countries of origin, trafficking victims often find themselves in a situation where their desire to witness against traffickers is blunted by the insufficient protection and incentives that witness programs in countries such as Bangladesh, India, Nepal and Sri Lanka offer and the corruptive practices eroding the boundaries between state agencies and traffickers.[42] In this sense, it seems less reasonable that victims are afraid to testify as neither the state, nor NGOs that cannot refuse to give evidence in court, proved to be reliable partners to allay their fears of reprisals by traffickers.

The creation of short-term donor policies including the allocation of resources to the building of shelters for trafficked women, such as the one built in Laos in 2004, proved ineffective to detect and respond to the root causes of trafficking such as poverty and domestic violence which are one of the major reasons for women to undertake risky migration decisions. [43] Moreover, as Limanowska noticed, many governments give short-term support to 'willing contractor' NGOs that they can control, thus limiting their already limited operational scope and making the allocation of resources biased and unbalanced. [44] In this sense, a vicious cycle is created due to the willingness of governments to prioritize short-term solutions rather than long-term strategies which are going to be arguably less noticeable and cherished by the electorate.

Another problem proves out to be the lack of reintegration programs and for example in the countries of Southeast Europe that proved to be countries of origin, transit and more recently of destination, there is not enough funding to assist victims with medical help, financial support, professional training and advises on how to avoid trafficking reoccurring. [45] In fact, this could be also understood more widely in terms of the unwillingness of IOs to cooperate among themselves due to an extreme competition for funding, among NGOs protecting trafficking victims that lack funding to organize regular meetings and agree on common strategies[46] or between the security sector and NGOs who still do not trust each other and are thus inadequate to exchange information and cooperate. [47] In this sense, problems of effective networking are making every step of the protection process even harder.

Finally, the security governance approach focusing on prevention in countries of origin proved inadequate to address the supply side of trafficking despite governments', IOs', NGOs', and businesses' efforts to warn about suspicious job offers, target high-risk groups, inform them about their rights and migration procedures. On the one hand, the effectiveness of awareness-raising campaigns in countries of origin developed with the purpose to inform citizens about the nature of trafficking is at best contested. For instance, due to their strong language and shocking content, some people perceived them as a tool to reduce migration in wealthy EU countries or even made families prevent their daughters to go outside as an Albanian case showed.[48] On the top of this, there is weak cooperation between countries in documenting and sharing experience about anti-trafficking campaigns' effectiveness which is perhaps why 'prevention strategies have failed to integrate into policies'. [49]

Nonetheless, these issues arguably pale in comparison with the inadequate addressing of the socio-economic root cause of trafficking such as unemployment, poverty, lack of access to medical services and education that are major factors for perilous migrations. In fact, there are insufficient development-oriented prevention programs due to lack of patron interest on the behalf of IOs and the businesses.[50] However, even if there are, agencies promoting gender equality and social support should be better equipped to identify labor market needs and to include anti-trafficking components within their activities.[51] It should be recognized that the occasional financial assistance that trafficking victims receive during various development initiatives is far from being a panacea as once the resource is exhausted, they are going to found themselves in the same position of vulnerability. Therefore, prevention of trafficking in

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

countries of origin is not prioritized and this has a direct negative impact on the distribution of efforts and resources.

Conclusions

In summary, this study has examined the reasons why human trafficking became a crime so difficult to fight by critically evaluating the fragile legal definitional basis provided by the Palermo Protocol and assessing the effectiveness of the anti-trafficking governance system's three approaches designed to prosecute traffickers, protect victims, and prevent trafficking in countries of origin. While the anti-trafficking security governance system evolved considerably and various mechanisms were created to combat this horrific crime, the transition from government to governance appeared to be not as smooth as we would like it to be. Being foundational for further action, the lack of common definition of trafficking as well as shortage of reliable data about the scope of the crime obscure any real development. Furthermore, prevention in countries of origin has been largely neglected which is barely acceptable having in mind the vital role of preventive measures for reducing the supply side of trafficking and thus undermine the efforts of traffickers. Similarly, protection of trafficking victims proved to be far from perfect and remains politically deprioritized and ill-funded. Finally, prosecution of traffickers is heavily mutilated by cultural and organizational blinders. Therefore, this study suggests that a more balanced and networked anti-trafficking efforts emerge and different actors recognize that success in one area will contribute to success in another as they are all highly interlinked, thus replacing institutional inertia, competition and lack of trust with cooperation, concerted action, and exchange of information among and between stakeholders. Interagency cooperation mechanisms against human trafficking are poorly developed while, for example, cooperation between security authorities and NGOs that provide support and protection to victims can enlighten the way leading directly to the traffickers.[52] Last but not least, the demand side in countries of destination is an under-researched issue that deserves the attention of academics and policy-makers as after all we should not forget that trafficking is a supply-demand illicit business process.

References

- Bales, K., 2014, *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy*, University of California Press.
- Baumeister, S. and Maley, S., 2005, The Role of the Private Sector in Developing Youth Careers, in 'Sector Project Against Trafficking in Women' in *Challenging Trafficking in Persons: Theoretical Debate & Practical Approaches*, (ed.) GTZ Sector Project Against Trafficking in Women, Baden-Baden: Nomos.
- Belser, P., 2005, *Forced Labour and Human Trafficking: Estimating the Profits*, Working Paper 42, International Labour Office: Geneva, online available at: <http://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1016&context=forcedlabor>, [Accessed on January 16th, 2016].
- Briand, S., 'Sold into Slavery: Ukrainian Girls Tricked into Sex Trade', *Agence France Presse*, January 28th, 2004.
- Callagher, A. and Holmes, P., 2008, Developing an effective criminal justice system response to human trafficking: Lessons from the front-line, *International Criminal Justice Review*, Vol.18, No.3, p. 318-343.
- Chuang, J. A., 2006, The United States as Global Sheriff: Using Unilateral Sanctions to Combat Human Trafficking, *Michigan Journal of International Law*, Vol. 27, No. 2, online available: <http://ssrn.com/abstract=990098>, [Accessed on January 16th, 2016].
- Council of Europe, 2005, *Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings*, online available at: https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/236093/8414.pdf, [Accessed on January 24th, 2016].
- Czempiel, E. and Rosenau, J. N. (eds.), 1992, *Governance Without Government: Order and Challenge in World Politics*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

David A. Feingold, 2010, 'Trafficking in Numbers' in P. Andreas and K. M. Greenhill (eds.) *Sex, Drugs, and Body Counts*, London: Cornell University Press.

Dempsey, M. M., Hoyle, C., and Bosworth, M., 2012, Defining Sex Trafficking in International and Domestic Law: Mind the Gaps, *Emory International Law Review*, Vol.26, p.137-62.

Dottridge, M., 2006, *Action To Prevent Child Trafficking in South Eastern Europe: A*

Dumienski, Z., 2011, Critical Reflections on Anti-human Trafficking: The Case of Timor-Leste', *Singapore: RSIS Centre for Non-Traditional Security (NTS) Studies for NTS-Asia*, Issue 2.

El-Cherkeh T., Stirbu, E., Lazaroiu, S. and Radu, D., 2004, *EU Enlargement, Migration and Trafficking in Women: The Case of South Eastern Europe*, Report 247, Hamburg: Hamburg Institute of International Economics.

Farrell, A. and Pfeffer, R., 2014, Policing Human Trafficking: Cultural Blinders and Organizational Barriers, *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science (AAPSS 653)*, Vol. 653, No. 1, p. 46-64.

Farrell, A., McDevitt, J. and Fahy, S., 2010, Where are all the victims? Understanding the determinants of official identification of human trafficking incidents, *Criminology & Public Policy*, Vol.9, No.2, p.201-233.

Free the Slaves, 2015, *Slavery Today*, online available at: <http://www.freetheslaves.net/about-slavery/slavery-today/>, [Accessed on January 15th, 2016].

Friesendorf, C., 2007, Pathologies of Security Governance: Efforts Against Human Trafficking in Europe, *Security Dialogue*, Vol. 38, No. 3, p. 379-402.

Give2Asia, 2004, *Safe Shelter Services for Women Victims of Violence and Trafficking in Laos*, A Give2Asia Project, online available at: <http://www.humantrafficking.org/uploads/updates/LaosSafeShelterProposal.pdf>, [Accessed on January 28th, 2016].

Goldstein, H., 1990, *Problem oriented policing*, New York, NY: McGraw Hill.

Goodey, J., 2008, Human trafficking: Sketchy data and policy responses, *Criminology and Criminal Justice*, Vol. 8, No. 4, p.421-442, Online available at: <http://crj.sagepub.com/content/8/4/421.short>, [Accessed on 25th October, 2015].

Haynes, D. F., 2004, Used, Abused, Arrested and Deported: Extending Immigration Benefits To Protect the Victims of Trafficking and To Secure the Prosecution of Traffickers, *Human Rights Quarterly*, Vol.26, No.2, p.221-272.

Huisman, W. and Kleemans, E. R., 2014, The Challenges of fighting sex trafficking in the legalized prostitution market of the Netherlands, *Crime Law Soc Change*, Vol.61, p.215-228.

International Labour Organization (ILO), 2012, *ILO Global Estimate of Forced Labour: Results and methodology*, online available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/-ed_norm/-declaration/documents/publication/wcms_182004.pdf, [Accessed on January 15th, 2016].

Jakobi, A. P., 2013, 'The Adoption of Crime Policies: Patterns and Strategies' in *Common Goods and Evils? The Formation of global Crime Governance*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, p.187-209.

Jean, A., 2013, *No Effective Trafficking Definition Exists: Domestic Implementation of the Palermo Protocol*, paper originally presented at: Voiceless Cargo: Symposium on Human Trafficking and Sex Slavery, Albany Law School in February 2013, online available at: <http://poseidon01.ssrn.com/delivery.php?ID=7260710670210260170890211151>

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

231180280580840220410610780260260310751210250680880930100100970401061040631210890821030011
141051070220840070770631130691240991010700920210050420710071060880970850251151181000751110
25096108005121010111016106089085019000127&EXT=pdf, [Accessed January 12th, 2016].

Krahmann, E., 2003, Conceptualizing Security Governance, *Cooperation and Conflict*, Vol.38, No.1, p. 5–26.

Laczko, F. and Gramegna, M. A., 2003, Developing Better Indications of Human Trafficking, *Brown Journal of World Affairs*, Vol.10, No.1, p.179-194.

Laczko, F., 2005, 'Introduction: Data and Research on Human Trafficking' in *Data and Research on Human Trafficking: A Global Survey Offprint of the Special Issue of International Migration*, Vol. 43, (1/2), Laczko, F. and Gozdzia, E. (eds.), p.5-17.

Limanowska, B., 2005, The Victim-Perspective – A Neglected Dimension, in 'Sector Project Against Trafficking in Women', eds., *Challenging Trafficking in Persons: Theoretical Debate & Practical Approaches*, Baden-Baden: Nomos, p.27–31.

Limanowska, B., 2005, *Trafficking in Human Beings in South Eastern Europe, Belgrade: UNICEF/UNOHCHR/OSCE-ODIHR*, online available at: www.unicef.org/ceecis/Trafficking.Report.2005.pdf, [Accessed on January 28th, 2016].

Mörner, N., 2009, Anti-trafficking efforts: hard to get results, *Baltic Worlds*, Vol.2, No.3/4, p. 1-7.

North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO), 2004, *NATO Policy on Combating Trafficking in Human Beings*, online available at: <http://www.nato.int/docu/comm/2004/06-istanbul/docu-traffic.htm>, [Accessed on January 17th, 2016].

Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE), 2008, *Efforts to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings in the OSCE area: Co-ordination and Reporting Mechanisms, Annual Report of the OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings*, presented at the Permanent Council Meeting, online available at: <http://www.osce.org/cthb/36159?download=true>, [Accessed on January 19th, 2016].

Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe's Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR), 2004, *Ensuring Human Rights Protection in Countries of Destination: Breaking the Cycle of Trafficking*, online available at: <http://www.osce.org/odihr/16201?download=true>, [Accessed on January 13th, 2016].

Preliminary Assessment, Geneva: UNICEF/Terre des Hommes.

Raab, J. and Milward, B. H., 2003, Dark Networks as Problems, *Journal of Public Administration Research & Theory*, Vol. 13, No. 4, p. 413–439

Shelley, L., 2010, *Human Trafficking: A Global Perspective*, Cambridge University Press.

The Global Slavery Index, 2014, *The Global Slavery Index 2014*, online available at: http://d1p5uxokz2c0lz.cloudfront.net/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/Global_Slavery_Index_2014_final_lowres.pdf, [Accessed on January 17th, 2015].

Trafficking in Persons: Theoretical Debate & Practical Approaches, Baden-Baden: Nomos.

United Nations High Commissioner For Refugees (UNHCR), 2005, *Combating Human Trafficking: Overview of UNHCR Anti-Trafficking Activities in Europe*, Geneva: Bureau for Europe Policy Unit, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees.

United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner, 2014, *Human Rights and Human Trafficking*, Fact

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

Sheet No. 36, online available at: http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/FS36_en.pdf, [Accessed on January 21st, 2016].

United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITR), 2009, *Human Trafficking and the Role of Local Governments Good Practices, Challenges and Ways Forward*, online available at: https://www.unitar.org/dcp/sites/unitar.org/dcp/files/uploads/newcoverhuman_trafficking_final.compressed.compressed.pdf, [Accessed on February 1st, 2016].

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2004, *United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols Thereto*, online available at: https://www.unodc.org/documents/middleeastandnorthafrica/organised-crime/UNITED_NATIONS_CONVENTION_AGAINST_TRANSNATIONAL_ORGANIZED_CRIME_AND_THE_PROTOCOLS_THERETO.pdf, [Accessed on January 8th, 2016].

United Nations Treaty Collection, 2015, *Chapter XVIII: Penal Matters 12 .a Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime*, online available at: https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=TREATY&mtdsg_no=XVIII-12-a&chapter=18&lang=en, [Accessed on January 10th, 2016].

UNODC, 2008, Law enforcement and Prosecution, *Chapter 5 Tool 5.18: Witness protection during and after the prosecution and trial*, online available at: https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/Toolkit-files/08-58296_tool_5-18.pdf, [Accessed on January 29th, 2016], p.255-256.

Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000, *Public Law 106–386*, 106th Congress, online available at: <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/10492.pdf>, [Accessed on January 11th, 2016].

Footnotes

[1] Despite the recognition that in practical terms human trafficking is the movement of one person for the purpose of enslavement and slavery is the exploitation that happens once they arrive, as a legal matter in many parts of the world trafficking means enslavement and there is no need for cross-border movement. In this sense, the two terms are going to be used by this study interchangeably. See Free the Slaves, 'Slavery questions & Answers', online available at: <http://www.freetheslaves.net/about-slavery/faqs-glossary/>, [Accessed on January 15th, 2016].

[2] Free the Slaves, 2015, *Slavery Today*, online available at: <http://www.freetheslaves.net/about-slavery/slavery-today/>, [Accessed on January 15th, 2016].

[3] International Labour Organization (ILO), 2012, *ILO Global Estimate of Forced Labour: Results and methodology*, online available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/-ed_norm/-declaration/documents/publication/wcms_182004.pdf, [Accessed on January 15th, 2016], p.13; The Global Slavery Index, 2014, online available at: http://d1p5uxokz2c0lz.cloudfront.net/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/Global_Slavery_Index_2014_final_lowres.pdf, [Accessed on January 17th, 2015], p.3.

[4] Patrick Belser, 2005, *Forced Labour and Human Trafficking: Estimating the Profits*, Working Paper 42, International Labour Office: Geneva, online available at: <http://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1016&context=forcedlabor>, [Accessed on January 16th, 2016], p.8.

[5] Kevin Bales, 2014, *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy*, University of California Press, p.1-5.

[6] Sylvie Briand, 'Sold into Slavery: Ukrainian Girls Tricked into Sex Trade', *Agence France Presse*, January 28th,

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

2004.

[7] Anja P. Jakobi, 2013, 'The Adoption of Crime Policies: Patterns and Strategies' in *Common Goods and Evils? The Formation of global Crime Governance*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, p.187-209.

[8] Louise Shelley, 2010, *Human Trafficking: A Global Perspective*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, p. 2.

[9] Jo Goodey, 2008, Human trafficking: Sketchy data and policy responses, *Criminology and Criminal Justice*, Vol. 8, No. 4, p.421-442, Online available at: <http://crj.sagepub.com/content/8/4/421.short>, [Accessed on 25th October, 2015].

[10] Frank Laczko, 2005, 'Introduction: Data and Research on Human Trafficking' in *Data and Research on Human Trafficking: A Global Survey Offprint of the Special Issue of International Migration*, Vol. 43, (1/2), Frank Laczko and Elzbieta Gozdzia (eds.), p.5-17.

[11] United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2004, *United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols Thereto*, online available at: https://www.unodc.org/documents/middleeastandnorthafrica/organised-crime/UNITED_NATIONS_CONVENTION_AGAINST_TRANSNATIONAL_ORGANIZED_CRIME_AND_THE_PROTOCOLS_THERETO.pdf, [Accessed on January 8th, 2016], p.41-51.

[12] United Nations Treaty Collection, 2015, *CHAPTER XVIII: PENAL MATTERS 12 .a Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime*, online available at: https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=TREATY&mtdsg_no=XVIII-12-a&chapter=18&lang=en, [Accessed on January 10th, 2016].

[13] Janie A. Chuang, 2006, The United States as Global Sheriff: Using Unilateral Sanctions to Combat Human Trafficking, *Michigan Journal of International Law*, Vol. 27, No. 2, online available: <http://ssrn.com/abstract=990098>, [Accessed on January 16th, 2016].

[14] United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2004, *United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols Thereto*, p. 42-43.

[15] Dempsey, Michelle Madden, Carolyn Hoyle, and Mary Bosworth, 2012, Defining Sex Trafficking in International and Domestic Law: Mind the Gaps, *Emory International Law Review*, Vol.26, no. 1, p.146 (overall:p.137-62).

[16] United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2004, *United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols Thereto*, p. 53-64. As conceptualized by the Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, smuggling becomes trafficking when there is exploitation of the person being smuggled through the whole process, from recruitment to arrival at the country of destination and a more constant relationship between the trafficked person and trafficker, higher levels of abuse and deception.

[17] Dempsey, Michelle Madden, Carolyn Hoyle, and Mary Bosworth, 2012, Defining Sex Trafficking in International and Domestic Law: Mind the Gaps, p.150.

[18] Allain Jean, 2013, No Effective Trafficking Definition Exists: Domestic Implementation of the Palermo Protocol, Paper originally presented at: *Voiceless Cargo: Symposium on Human Trafficking and Sex Slavery, Albany Law School*, in February 2013, online available at: <http://poseidon01.ssrn.com/delivery.php?ID=726071067021026017089021115123118028058084022041061078026026031075121025068088093010010097040106104063121089082103001114105107022084007077063113069124099101070092021005042071007106088097085025115118100075111025096108005121010111016106089085019000127&EXT=pdf>, [Accessed January 12th, 2016].

[19] OSCE's Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR), 2004, *Ensuring Human Rights Protection*

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

in *Countries of Destination: Breaking the Cycle of Trafficking*, online available at: <http://www.osce.org/odihr/16201?download=true>, [Accessed on January 13th, 2016], p.25-68.

[20] Frank Laczko and Marco A. Gramegna, 2003, Developing Better Indications of Human Trafficking, *Brown Journal of World Affairs*, Vol.10, No.1, p.181, (overall: p.179-194); Zbigniew, Dumiencki, 2011, Critical Reflections on Anti-human Trafficking: The Case of Timor-Leste', *Singapore: RSIS Centre for Non-Traditional Security (NTS) Studies for NTS-Asia*, Issue 2; David A. Feingold, 2010, 'Trafficking in Numbers' in P. Andreas and K. M. Greenhill (eds.) *Sex, Drugs, and Body Counts*, London: Cornell University Press.

[21] Jo Goodey, 2008, Human trafficking: Sketchy data and policy responses, p.424-427.

[22] Cornelius Friesendorf, 2007, Pathologies of Security Governance: Efforts Against Human Trafficking in Europe, *Security Dialogue*, Vol. 38, No. 3, p.384.

[23] Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000, Public Law 106-386, 106th Congress, online available at: <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/10492.pdf>, [Accessed on January 11th, 2016]. While adopted in the US, the TVPA is trying to bring about changes in other parts of the world as it sanctions nations not doing enough to halt human trafficking, however critics argue that it is too weak to enforce any real changes in behavior as based on political interest (e.g. countries such as Saudi Arabia or Japan known for their forced-labor practices are put in Tier 2 and are not being sanctioned; e.g. Japan's response to the US pressure to curtail sex trafficking by holding a symposium and sending few million dollars aid to Cambodia to deal with the problem and showing their 'concern').

[24] NATO, 2004, *NATO Policy on Combating Trafficking in Human Beings*, online available at: <http://www.nato.int/docu/comm/2004/06-istanbul/docu-traffic.htm>, [Accessed on January 17th, 2016].

[25] OSCE, 2008, *Efforts to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings in the OSCE area: Co-ordination and Reporting Mechanisms*, Annual Report of the OSCE Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings presented at the Permanent Council Meeting, online available at: <http://www.osce.org/cthb/36159?download=true>, [Accessed on January 19th, 2016].

[26] Council of Europe, 2005, Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, online available at: https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/236093/8414.pdf, [Accessed on January 24th, 2016].

[27] Ernst-Otto Czempiel and James N. Rosenau (eds.), 1992, *Governance Without Government: Order and Challenge in World Politics*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

[28] Amy Farrell and Rebecca Pfeffer, 2014, Policing Human Trafficking: Cultural Blinders and Organizational Barriers, *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science (AAPSS 653)*, Vol. 653, No. 1, p. 46 (overall:p. 46-64); United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner, 2014, Human Rights and Human Trafficking, Fact Sheet No. 36, online available at: http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/FS36_en.pdf, [Accessed on January 21st, 2016]. p.16-18.

[29] Dina F.Haynes, 2004, Used, Abused, Arrested and Deported: Extending Immigration Benefits To Protect the Victims of Trafficking and To Secure the Prosecution of Traffickers, *Human Rights Quarterly*, Vol.26, No.2, p.221-272.

[30] *Ibid.*

[31] Barbara Limanowska, 2005, The Victim-Perspective – A Neglected Dimension, in Sector Project Against Trafficking in Women, eds., *Challenging Trafficking in Persons: Theoretical Debate & Practical Approaches*, Baden-Baden: Nomos, p.28 (overall: p.27-31); UNHCR, 2005, *Combating Human Trafficking: Overview of UNHCR Anti-*

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

Trafficking Activities in Europe, Geneva: Bureau for Europe Policy Unit, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees.

[32] UNHCR, 2005, Combatting Human Trafficking, *See country reports*.

[33] Amy Farrell, Jack McDevitt, and Stephanie Fahy, 2010, Where are all the victims? Understanding the determinants of official identification of human trafficking incidents, *Criminology & Public Policy*, Vol.9, No.2, p.201-233.

[34] Cornelius Friesendorf, 2007, Pathologies of Security Governance: Efforts Against Human Trafficking in Europe, *Security Dialogue*, Vol. 38, No. 3, p. 379-402, Interview conducted by Cornelius Friesendorf in Sarajevo on 29 August 2006.

[35] Anne Callagher and Paul Holmes, 2008, Developing an effective criminal justice system response to human trafficking: Lessons from the front-line, *International Criminal Justice Review*, Vol.18, No.3, p. 318-343.

[36] Find reference in: David A. Feingold, 2005, Human trafficking, *Foreign Policy*, No.150, p.26-32, Online available at: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/30048506>, [Accessed on October 17th, 2015].

[37] Herman Goldstein, 1990, *Problem oriented policing*, New York, NY: McGraw Hill.

[38] Jörg Raab and Brinton H. Milward, 2003, Dark Networks as Problems, *Journal of Public Administration Research & Theory*, Vol. 13, No. 4, p. 413-439.

[39] Wim Huisman and Edward R. Kleemans, 2014, The Challenges of fighting sex trafficking in the legalized prostitution market of the Netherlands, *Crime Law Soc Change*, Vol.61, p.215-228.

[40] Sebastian Baumeister and Susie Maley, 2005, 'The Role of the Private Sector in Developing

Youth Careers', in Sector Project Against Trafficking in Women, eds., *Challenging*

Trafficking in Persons: Theoretical Debate & Practical Approaches, Baden-Baden: Nomos, p.81-85.

[41] David A. Feingold, 2005, Human trafficking, *Foreign Policy*, No.150, p.26-32, Online available at: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/30048506>, [Accessed on October 17th, 2015].

[42] UNODC, 2008, Law enforcement and Prosecution, *Chapter 5 Tool 5.18: Witness protection during and after the prosecution and trial*, online available at: https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/Toolkit-files/08-58296_tool_5-18.pdf, [Accessed on January 29th, 2016], p.255-256.

El-Cherkeh Tanja, Elena Stirbu, Sebastian LazaroIU and Dragos Radu, 2004, EU Enlargement, Migration and Trafficking in Women: The Case of South Eastern Europe, Report 247, Hamburg: Hamburg Institute of International Economics, p.23-24.

[43] Give2Asia, 2004, *Safe Shelter Services for Women Victims of Violence and Trafficking in Laos*, A Give2Asia Project, online available at: <http://www.humantrafficking.org/uploads/updates/LaosSafeShelterProposal.pdf>, [Accessed on January 28th, 2016]; Cornelius Friesendorf, 2007, Pathologies of Security Governance: Efforts Against Human Trafficking in Europe, Interview conducted by Cornelius Friesendorf with social service providers in Bulgaria, Macedonia, Kosovo, and Bosnia in July-August, 2006.

[44] Barbara Limanowska, 2005, *Trafficking in Human Beings in South Eastern Europe*, Belgrade: UNICEF/UNOHCHR/OSCE-ODIHR, online available at: www.unicef.org/ceecis/Trafficking.Report.2005.pdf,

Why Is It So Difficult to Fight Human Trafficking?

Written by Mariya Grozdanova

[Accessed on January 28th, 2016], p.53.

[45] Cornelius Friesendorf, 2007, Pathologies of Security Governance: Efforts Against Human Trafficking in Europe, Interview conducted by Cornelius Friesendorf with NGO representatives in Southeast Europe, September 2005 and July-August 2006.

[46] El-Cherkeh Tanja, Elena Stirbu, Sebastian LazaroIU and Dragos Radu, 2004, EU Enlargement, Migration and Trafficking in Women, p.98.

[47] Ninna Mörner, 2009, Anti-trafficking efforts: hard to get results, Baltic Worlds, Vol.2, No.3/4, p. 1-7.

[48] Mike Dottridge, 2006, *Action To Prevent Child Trafficking in South Eastern Europe: A*

Preliminary Assessment, Geneva: UNICEF/Terre des Hommes, p.51.

[49] United Nations Institute for Training and Research, 2009, *Human Trafficking and the Role of Local Governments Good Practices, Challenges and Ways Forward*, online available at: https://www.unitar.org/dcp/sites/unitar.org.dcp/files/uploads/newcoverhuman_trafficking_final.compressed.compressed.pdf, [Accessed on February 1st, 2016].

[50] Barbara Limanowska, 2005, Trafficking in Human Beings in South Eastern Europe, p.9.

[51] Cornelius Friesendorf, 2007, Pathologies of Security Governance: Efforts Against Human Trafficking in Europe, p. 395.

[52] UNHCR, 2005, Combatting Human Trafficking: Overview of UNHCR Anti-Trafficking Activities in Europe, p.8.

Written by: Mariya Grozdanova
Written at: Royal Holloway, University of London
Written for: Dr. Viviane Dittrich
Date written: 03/2016